CITY OF SANTA BARBARA
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

RESOLUTION RECOMMENDING THAT CITY COUNCIL
HOLD A PUBLIC HEARING
TO CONSIDER LANDMARK DESIGNATION OF
THE HODGES HOUSE AT
2112 SANTA BARBARA STREET, SANTA BARBARA, CALIFORNIA
APN 025-252-006 and 007

RESOLUTION 2013-6

NOVEMBER 6, 2013

WHEREAS, Section 22.22.050 of the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara grants the Historic Landmarks Commission the authority to initiate a designation process to recommend to the City Council the designation as a City Landmark of any structure, natural feature, site or area having historic, architectural, archaeological, cultural or aesthetic significance; and

WHEREAS, the property owner submitted a statement of support of the City Landmark designation on October 15, 2013; and

WHEREAS, on October 23, 2013, the Historic Landmarks Commission adopted Resolution of Intention 2013-5 to hold a public hearing to begin the landmark designation process for the Hodges House located at 2112 Santa Barbara Street, Assessor’s Parcel No. 025-252-007; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Structure Report accepted on March 27, 2013, by the Historic Landmark Commission has determined that the property listed in the title of this document qualifies for historic designation under City of Santa Barbara Master Environmental Assessment (MEA) criteria; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Structure Report of 2013 found the house at 2112 Santa Barbara Street designed by the noted architectural firm of Soule, Murphy and Hastings in 1921 in the Mediterranean style and the landscape designed by noted landscape architect Ralph Tallant Stevens is significant for its historical and architectural influence on the heritage of the City; and

WHEREAS, the proposed boundary of the City Landmark designation is the entire parcel, including large specimen trees noted on the landscape plan in the designation file, with the exception of the non-contributing elements as per exhibit A; and
WHEREAS, the owners’ plans for restoration of the estate to its original use and configuration, based on the original 1921 plans, will enhance the historic integrity of the property; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Landmarks Commission has reviewed the proposed restoration of the property and landscape elements to ensure that it will be completed according to The Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties; and

WHEREAS, under the provisions of Article 19, Section 15308 of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines and the City List of Activities Determined to Qualify for a Categorical Exemption (City council Resolution Dated November 10, 1998), staff has determined that designation of the Hodges House as a City Landmark is eligible for a Categorical Exemption; and

WHEREAS, Section 22.22.050 of the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara states that the City Council may designate as a Landmark any structure, natural feature, site or area having historic, architectural, archeological, cultural, or aesthetic significance by adopting a resolution of designation within 90 days following receipt of a recommendation from the Historic Landmark Commission, and;

WHEREAS, in summary, the Historic Landmark Commission finds that the Hodges House located at 2112 Santa Barbara Street, Assessor’s Parcel No. 025-252-007, meets the following City Landmark criteria (A through K) listed in section 22.22.040 of the Municipal Code:

A. Its character, interest or value as a significant part of the heritage of the City, the State or the Nation;
C. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the culture and development of the City, the State, or the Nation;
D. Its exemplification of a particular architectural style or way of life important to the City, the State, or the Nation;
E. Its exemplification of the best remaining architectural type in a neighborhood.
F. Its identification as the creation, design, or work of a person or persons whose effort significantly influenced the heritage of the City, the State, or the Nation;
G. Its embodiment of elements demonstrating outstanding attention to architectural design, detail, materials and craftsmanship;
I. Its unique location or singular physical characteristic representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that on November 6, 2013, the Historic Landmarks Commission of the City of Santa Barbara hereby recommends to the City Council that it designate the Hodges House located at 2112 Santa Barbara Street, Assessor’s Parcel No. 025-252-007 as a City Landmark and makes findings based on the historic and cultural significance of facts presented in the Staff Report.

CITY OF SANTA BARBARA
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Adopted: November 6, 2013
Background:
The Italian Mediterranean style house at 2112 Santa Barbara Street was constructed in 1921 for Walter Hodges, a leading figure associated with the Santa Fe Railroad. It has been on the Santa Barbara Potential Historic Resources list since 1986. Historic research in the form of a Historic Structures Report prepared by Post /Hazeltine Associates dated March 5, 2013 and approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission on March 27, 2013 has determined that the Hodges House and Property Improvements located at 2112 Santa Barbara Street, Assessor’s Parcel Number 025-252-007, qualifies for historic designation as a City Landmark under City of Santa Barbara Master Environmental Assessment criteria. The current owners, SB Restore, LLC, have been working with the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) to restore the property according to the Standards for Rehabilitation established by the Secretary of the Interior. The proposed boundary of the City Landmark designation is the entire parcel, including large specimen trees noted on the landscape plan in the designation file, with the exception of the non-contributing elements as per exhibit A-1 through A-4 of the Resolution of Designation. The house was designed by the noted architectural firm of Soule, Murphy and Hastings and the landscape was designed by noted landscape architect, Ralph Tallant Stevens. The property consists of the main building, a garage and servants quarters and designed landscape. This staff report summarizes the extensive historic research and analysis of the Historic Structures Report.
Vicinity Map, City of Santa Barbara Mapping Analysis and Printing System, 2013, Hodges House
Site plan after restoration from 2013
Construction Documents.
**Historic Context:**

The Italian Mediterranean style, two-story building, and its detached garage and servants quarters cottage were designed by the noted architectural firm of Soule, Murphy and Hastings. The house was constructed of hollow, clay tile clad in plaster with a hipped, terra cotta tile roof. The Italianate style landscaping for the property was designed by noted landscape architect Ralph Tallant Stevens. The house and the designed landscape represent rare surviving examples of an Italian Mediterranean style house and Italianate style garden.

The house was the residence of Walter Hodges, Vice President of the Santa Fe Railroad during the early twentieth century who is considered a significant historical figure. Hodges and his family lived in the house for 21 years, from the time of construction until 1942, during which no alterations were made to the house. The house remained a residence until 1951 when the Congregation of B’nai B’rith purchased the property and converted the house from residential to non-residential use. It was owned by the Church of the Summit Lighthouse from 1973 until 1983 when it was sold to the Fielding Institute, a post secondary educational institution who sold it to the current owners in 2012. The current owners intend to restore the property to its original residential use.

There have been only a few exterior alterations made to the main house since its construction, including the removal of the two pergolas on the second floor in the 1940s and the addition of an exterior exit stairway on the rear elevation. The original garage located off the east end of the house was designed as a three-bay garage with an attached cottage used as a servants quarters. The garage and servants quarters were converted into and activity room and office by removing the original doors and adding windows and awnings. Almost all of the designed landscape’s original hardscape features, including the sandstone retaining wall and curbing, masonry walls and the form and plan of the rear garden, including the wall fountain and walkways have remained in place. The most notable alteration since 1922 when the original landscape was completed has been the construction of a paved parking lot off the southwest corner of the house. Despite these changes, the Historic Structures Report found that the property at 2112 Santa Barbara Street has retained its integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. The current owners’ plans for restoration of the property based on the original 1921 plans, will enhance the historic integrity of the property.
The 1921, Italian Mediterranean style house and Italianate style designed landscape contribute to a substantially intact streetscape. The surrounding streetscape has retained most of the inventory of historic houses as well as curbs, sidewalks and retaining walls. The well-preserved streetscape on the east side of Santa Barbara Street is illustrative of the development of Santa Barbara’s upper class neighborhoods during the first three decades of the twentieth century that were connected by streetcar lines and a network of paved streets to the downtown. Largely built-out by the early 1930s, the streetscape surrounding the Hodges House and Property Improvements has preserved sufficient integrity to convey its historic appearance.

**Italian Mediterranean Style**
The Period Revival movement encompassed a diverse range of architectural influences, such as Tudor, French Norman, Spanish, Italian Renaissance, Italian Mediterranean, American colonial and Spanish Colonial styles. An important part of Santa Barbara’s architecture, the Italian Mediterranean pre-dates the Spanish Colonial Revival and was key to Santa Barbara’s spirit as the new American Riviera. Having both the climate and geography similar to the coastal hill-towns of the Italian Riviera, Santa Barbara embraced the Italian Villa as architecture and garden design well suited to the Santa Barbara lifestyle. As Interpreted by early twentieth century architects, such as Soule, Murphy and Hastings, the Italian Mediterranean style drew heavily from the architectural heritage of Renaissance Spain and Italy. Stylistic characteristics include: an overall symmetry to the massing and façade of the building; arched openings and symmetrically aligned windows; the low pitched, hipped roof, covered in terra cotta tiles; deep, overhanging boxed-in eaves; and stucco siding.

**Architectural Firm of Soule, Murphy and Hastings (1921-1926)**
The house was designed by the firm of Soule, Murphy and Hastings, one of the Santa Barbara region’s most noted architectural firms in the early twentieth century. Windsor Soule, the principal of the firm, first came to Santa Barbara in 1912 as an associate of the architect Russell Ray who had already had an established practice. In 1916 they hired John Frederic Murphy to join the firm. Russell Ray left the firm in 1917 to fight in World War 1. Leaving just Soule and Murphy. In 1921 they brought in Henry Hastings. All of three partners of the firm became significant architects in their own right. Moreover, the firm played an important role in developing a regional architectural style for California inspired by the state’s colonial period missions.
and Spanish and Italian Mediterranean antecedents. Because the firm made such significant contributions to the architectural heritage of Santa Barbara, their legacy lies in the firm’s concerted effort to make Mediterranean and Spanish Colonial Revival the city’s dominant architectural styles at a time when these regional styles were achieving great popularity.

**Landscape Architect, Ralph Tallant Stevens**

Ralph Tallant Stevens (1882-1958) was a visionary landscape architect who employed indigenous, native flora set within a naturalistic setting then integrated it with more traditional plantings laid out in a forma scheme. His work in Santa Barbara included the landscape designs for portions of Franceschi Park, Alameda Park, Oak Park, the Bird Refuge, and Plaza del Mar, as well as the plantings along Cabrillo Boulevard and many residential commissions. At 2112 Santa Barbara, a series of parterres outlined with boxed hedges planted with roses and other flowering annuals and perennials were located on a second cross axis near the south end of the south vista. Hardscape features included axially-aligned brick pathways, pergolas and a wall fountain. The design vocabulary of these landscapes was generally drawn from classical, European antecedents.

*Above: 2013 Photograph of detail of wall fountain that was part of the Ralph Tallant Stevens designed landscape completed in 1922.*
Significance:
The City of Santa Barbara establishes historic significance as provided by the Municipal Code, Section 22.22.040. Any historic building that meets one or more of the eleven criteria (Criteria A through K) established for a City Landmark or a City Structure of Merit can be considered significant. The Hodges House and Property Improvements meets the following criteria:

**Criterion A, its character, interest or value as a significant part of the heritage of the City, the State or the Nation:**

The house, garage and servants’ quarters represent examples of the work of Soule, Murphy and Hastings, one of the leading interpreters of the Period Revival movement in the Santa Barbara region between 1921 and 1926. The landscaped garden represents a rare surviving and substantially intact example of the work of Ralph Tallant Stevens, one of the region’s leading landscape architects. Moreover, the property served as the residence of Walter Hodges, a leading early twentieth century industrialist from 1909 until his retirement in 1930. Therefore the property at 2112 Santa Barbara Street is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark under criterion A.

**Criterion C: Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the culture and development of the City, the State, or the Nation:**

The property served as the residence of Walter Hodges, a leading early twentieth century industrialist who was vice president of the Santa Fe Railroad (Atchison, Topeka, Santa Fe Railroad) between 1909 and 1930. Hodges played a leading role in the expansion of the railroad’s California Limited and Santa Fe De Lux routes, which used the Southern Pacific’s coastal rail line to extend its passenger service from Los Angeles to San Francisco. As a popular resort destination for the affluent, Santa Barbara was an important component of the railroads California passenger service during first four decades of twentieth century. Hodges also made important contributions to the development of real estate holdings during the early twentieth century, most notably, Rancho Santa Fe, a planned community in Southern California. Because Hodges played an important role in the development of California during the early twentieth century, the property at 2112 Santa Barbara, which was his residence for 21 years, is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark under criterion C.

**Criterion D: Its exemplification of a particular architectural style or way of life important to the City, the State, or the Nation:**

The Italian Mediterranean style house, garage and servants quarters represent examples of the work of Soule, Murphy and Hastings, one of the leading interpreters of the Period Revival movement in the Santa Barbara region between 1921 and 1926. The house is an almost intact example of the Italian Mediterranean style. The landscaped garden represents a rare surviving and substantially intact example of the work of Ralph Tallant.
Stevens, one of the region’s leading landscape architect. The garden, which drew inspiration from the gardens of the Italian Renaissance, was a type of landscape scheme that enjoyed a widespread resurgence in popularity in the designs of large, early twentieth century estates. Therefore, the property is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark under criterion D.

**Criterion E, Its exemplification of the best remaining architectural type in a neighborhood.**

The Italian Mediterranean style house, the garage and servants’ quarters, and the substantially intact Italianate style garden represent the neighborhood’s best surviving example of an early twentieth century Italian Mediterranean style estate. Therefore, the property is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark under criterion E.

**Criterion F, its identification as the creation, design, or work of a person or persons whose effort significantly influenced the heritage of the City, the State, or the Nation:**

The Italian Mediterranean style house, garage and servant’s quarters represent examples of the work of Soule, Murphy and Hastings, one of the leading interpreters of the Period Revival movement in the Santa Barbara region between 1921 and 1926. Although, the Italianate style garden enjoyed widespread popularity in large estates in the early twentieth century, the landscape design of the Hodges House and Property Improvements represents a rare surviving example of a design by Ralph Tallant Stevens, one of the region’s leading landscape architects. Therefore, the property is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark under criterion F.

**Criterion G, its embodiment of elements demonstrating outstanding attention to architectural design, detail, materials and craftsmanship:**

The house demonstrates outstanding attention to architectural detail in the Italian Mediterranean style design as well as the details, materials and craftsmanship of the wood entrance door and intricately designed door surround, wood casement windows, terra cotta roof tiles, and iron balconies. Because the buildings and surrounding garden continue to convey the outstanding attention to design, detail, materials and craftsmanship found in estate architecture and landscape design in the Santa Barbara region during the 1920s, the property is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark under criterion G.

*Above:* 2013 Photographs demonstrating the outstanding attention to architectural detail and craftsmanship in the front elevation windows and doors.
Criterion I, Its unique location or singular physical characteristic representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood.

Set at the corner of Santa Barbara Street and East Padre Street, the buildings and the sandstone walls along the street edge have formed an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood for 92 years. Therefore, the property is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark under criterion I.

Historical Integrity:

In addition to determining significance, there are essential physical features that must be considered to evaluate the integrity of a significant building. The house, the garage and servants quarters and the remaining features of the original landscaping and hardscape, including the sandstone retaining walls and curbs, have maintained sufficient integrity to convey its original appearance. The Historic Structures Report found that the property at 2112 Santa Barbara Street has retained its integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association.

Recommendation:

Staff Recommends that the HLC adopt a resolution to recommend to City Council that the Hodges House and Property Improvements be designated as a City Landmark. Staff recommends the proposed boundary of the City Landmark designation be the entire parcel, including large specimen trees noted on landscape plan in the designation file, with the exception of the non-contributing elements as per exhibits A-1 through A-4 of the Resolution of Designation.

Works Cited: