

City of Santa Barbara
City Clerk's Office
City Council

RECEIVED

2014 NOV 14 PM 4:30

November 14, 2014

CITY OF SANTA BARBARA
CITY CLERK'S OFFICE

Appeal of Decision by the Planning Commission

Date of Meeting: November 6, 2014

We are appealing the Planning Commission's approval of the Coastal Development Permit (CDP) for 511 Brosian Way, Santa Barbara, CA

Application of Brian Cearnel, Architect for John Park, 511 Brosian Way, APN 047-030-011, A-1 Zone, Local Coastal Plan Designation: Low Density Residential (MST2014-00149)(CDP2014-00011)

We appeal all Planning Commission approvals on the following grounds:

1. This project at 511 Brosian Way, located in a Hillside Design District, calls for excessive grading of 3870 cubic yards of fill in an area where the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines states more than 500 cubic yards of fill is to be avoided. 3870 cubic yards of fill will require 380 truckloads of dirt within the Coastal area adjacent to a dry creek.
2. The applicant failed to meet the requirement of the Single Family Design Board and hand deliver notices of

the project to the neighbors. This is a requirement should not be waived.

3. The north and east boundary of the property at 511 Brosian Way has a dry creek that comes to life in the rainy season. The creek and its setback are not buildable and therefore should not be counted in the lot size to calculate the FAR. The creek and setback were not removed from the buildable area when the FAR was calculated. The plans show a section 50 by 250 feet as being non-buildable. This is 12,500 square feet.
4. Neighborhood Compatibility- The project is not compatible with the Braemar Ranch neighborhood in terms of its size, mass, bulk, and scale. The average house in the entire Braemar Ranch area is actually smaller than the applicant's 20 house average. The applicant selected 20 of the largest houses and found the average size is 4000 square feet. This house is 5886 square feet, almost 2000 square feet over the average and 104% over FAR (floor to area ratio). We ask that the size of the house be reduced. Mrs. Pujo of the Planning Commission stated she was concerned by this 104% of FAR as the constant "creep" of houses that keep getting larger. 85% of FAR is the suggested size. City commissions allow these houses to get larger and larger when they know the public is against this practice. 85% of FAR is the guideline. Let's stay closer to that figure.

5. Raising the building pad ten or more feet above the existing grade with excessive fill of 3870 cubic yards and placing a two-story structure on top of it is not compatible with our neighborhood. Our homes on slopes are nestled in the hills so as not to be seen by their neighbors. This massive man made hill and house will loom over the neighbors and impact the surrounding neighbors' ambiance and neighborhood view of their surroundings.
6. The project lacks merit as it shows no respect for the Hillside Design District in which it is located.
7. This is an aggressive project in its amount of fill and for its huge house size. This is a flatland house being placed on an artificially created building pad of 3870 cubic yards of fill. This project is not compatible with a sloped lot in the Hillside Design District of Braemar Ranch in the Campanil neighborhood. Further, the house is actually placed in the back of the lot where the slope is close to 20%.
8. Neighborhood Compatibility- The design of the house is too modern and looks utilitarian, like a giant commercial factory from the street on the east and from the neighbors on the west. This prominent severe modern massing is not compatible with Braemar Ranch, a rural bucolic neighborhood zoned for agriculture where residents have raised horses, goats, chickens, ducks, geese, and even pot bellied pigs. Residents have truck farms and orchards and have sold their produce at our local Farmer's Market. This

house is completely out of character with our rural neighborhood. Looking at the elevations one can see what an enormous commercial looking structure this house is.

-
-
-
-
9. Neighborhood Compatibility- Wanting a better ocean view is not reason enough to raise the building pad 10 feet above the original lot elevation. It allows this extremely long house to loom over the street and the neighbors below.

 10. Nighttime Pollution- The large walls of glass will be another in a series of lights lighting up the night sky. This in an area that has two street lights. This glass house will look like a beacon on a hill and obscure the stars. It will be very prominent from all the surrounding houses.

 11. The Planning Commission told us our area is in transition. We ask WHY? It is because our City boards and commissions allow out of area applicants to design houses that are not compatible with our neighborhoods like the Braemar Ranch Hillside neighborhood where houses are nestled into the hillside so as not to be seen by the house above. It seems if our area is in transition it is in part because of the Planning Commission and the SFDB. We reject the notion that these commissions and boards will determine our neighborhood character. In three years time will they be allowing applicants to create building

pads with 6000 cubic yards of fill and allow 10,000 square foot houses?

12. The newly contoured lot with the applicant's fill will create a 20% slope or more on the property. Therefore, by their own actions they now must follow the Hillside Housing Design Guidelines and step the house into the hill by terracing it, varying the roof line, and honor the sloping landscape and the building guidelines set up by the City of Santa Barbara after many years of planning and public input.
13. This house sets a precedent in the City of Santa Barbara and certainly in our area by raising the building pad 10 feet into the air to get a better ocean view. If you allow this house to be built as designed you will open the flood gates for every designer to flaunt our City Guidelines, including Neighborhood Compatibility, and build enormous houses with excessive grading in many of our neighborhoods. Send this house back to the drawing board, reduce the height and size of the building pad, design a house that fits in our rural area, require the applicant to follow our rules and respect our slopes by terracing the house into the hill and break up its unending line on its own created ridgeline.
14. Two people spoke in favor of this house at the Planning Commission meeting November 6, 2014. Their brief testimony should be discounted. One is an active builder named, David Young. He built the three largest houses in our neighborhood. The ABR at the time

down played the sizes of the houses by saying they are up a private driveway and will not really be seen or impact the area. Now they are used in calculating the average house size. The other speaking was the neighbor above this project. The driveway to his house is on an easement on this applicant's property.

We ask that the applicant reduce the scope of the project, reduce the size of the house, design a house that is sympathetic to the character of the neighborhood, lower the height of the building pad, and respect the City's Hillside Design designation of this neighborhood by respecting the existing slope as illustrated in the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.

Signed, Patricia Foley
Patricia Foley, ^{APPELLANT} applicant and *PF*

Former President of the Braemar Ranch Homeowners Association

515 Braemar Ranch Lane
Santa Barbara, CA
93109
805-452-1108