



City of Santa Barbara
Planning Division

Memorandum

DATE: April 16, 2010

TO: Planning Commission
Architectural Board of Review

FROM: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

SUBJECT: Beverages and More 3052 State Street Proposal
Consistency with Upper State Street Area Design Guidelines

The Planning Commission has requested that staff provide a consistency analysis check for the Beverages and More (BevMo!) 3052 State Street Proposal and the Upper State Street Area Design Guidelines (USSDG).

Typically, this consistency analysis is completed by a case planner prior to Concept reviews. However, this analysis was not provided to the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) since the project did not have a case planner assigned as it is not subject to Planning Commission review and so design review staff is providing the analysis at this time.

The project is scheduled for Final ABR approval next week, it is suggested that consistency with USSDG should be examined carefully prior to granting Final Approval of the project.

Staff review shows that there are a number of project components (12 topics) which, if they were included in the project, would increase the project's consistency with the USSDG. Following is an analysis of project components and guidelines. Given the number of inconsistencies with the USSDG, the ABR should document why these project components can not be incorporated implemented into this major demolition/remodel project.

For each topic discussed, applicable guidelines are reproduced in Times New Roman font after the discussion. In some cases, applicable phrases of the USSDG are bolded for emphasis in the quoted text.

I. Project Consistency with USSDG

The parking lot layout appears consistent with the USSDG, in that the layout allows for access from the alley. (Guidelines 5 and 6).

Goal: Develop parking policies and management strategies that help reduce Upper State Street congestion.

Guidelines:

5. **Parking Guidance.** Reference the City of Santa Barbara's Standards for Parking Design and Architectural Board of Review Guidelines to assist in determining appropriate parking layout design for redevelopment, addressing factors including size and depth of lot, scenic view considerations on the north and south sides of the street, avoiding or removing barriers between parking lots, consideration for minimizing driveway curb cuts and proximity to connecting side streets and alleys. Also see Guidelines 60 and 61 which discuss parking lot access design to avoid mid-block street congestion.

6. **Rear Parking.** In general, parking at the rear of buildings creates a pleasant streetscape, can be more easily accessed from alleys and driveways on side streets and may reduce the number of driveways on State Street. Per Guideline 17, parking to the side or front of a building can be appropriate where there are special view considerations. Other exceptions to this guideline in the East and Central sub-areas are considered for remodels, new buildings on small lots, and building addition projects when the proposed alternative layout:

- Provides setbacks and building orientations compatible with existing adjacent development setbacks and building orientations.
- Respects surrounding business patterns and uses.
- Improves circulation within the project's block.

Exterior materials and colors. The tile roof, stucco and colors appear consistent with USSDG.

Goal: Preserve and enhance the unique character of Upper State Street and its sub-areas and sub-neighborhoods.

Guidelines:

11. **Key Characteristics.** The Upper State Street corridor, sub-areas, and sub-neighborhoods have key characteristics that define their character and sense of place. Proposals should be within a range of architectural styles and materials appropriate within each sub-area. Inclusion of more contemporary styles and natural materials such as sandstone, stucco, and tile is encouraged in the Upper State Street corridor.

44. **Color in Architecture.** Light colors typical of those found in Mediterranean buildings is preferred. This includes pastels and mottled color combinations.

46. **Exterior Finishes.** The use of plaster as an exterior material is encouraged. Additional quality materials such as wood, masonry or tile may also be used. An appropriate mix of materials may be employed to add variation and articulation to architectural forms and styles. Excessively reflective or mirrored exterior

materials shall be avoided. Glazing and fenestration should be used in a manner which is consistent with the proposed building's architectural style. Larger glazing areas should be articulated to provide scale to openings. Glass which is excessively tinted or mirrored shall be avoided.

II. Project Inconsistencies with USSDG

Topics covered in this memo where the project's consistency with USSDG guidelines could be better include:

Entrance Location	Landscaping – Views Preservation
Connecting Pedestrian Paseo	Sidewalk Tree Grates
Trash Dumpster Location	Lighting
Front Façade	Signage
Adjacent Bus Stop Opportunities	Shopping Carts
Bicycle Parking	Warehouse Activities

Entrance Location. A pedestrian entrance located closer to State Street would be much more consistent with USSDG #45 than the current entry location. A pedestrian entrance closer to State Street would also bring consistency with guidelines listed for "front façade" guidelines, listed below.

45. **Entrances.** Entries should be generously proportioned and visually transparent to encourage connections to the public realm. Main entrances should address the street. Secondary entrances may be located to connect to parking.

Connecting Pedestrian Paseo. Guidelines 13, 19 and 62 call for paseos to connect commercial and nearby residential uses to facilitate a pedestrian environment. Analysis of this block shows that this site provides superior opportunity for such a paseo compared with most other properties on this block. Continuing the pedestrian path from State Street all the way through to the rear alley would accomplish a pedestrian paseo and better consistency with these guidelines. One short-term consideration is that the current proposed use of this building may create a stronger desire among neighbors to have a stronger buffer and separate this use from the adjacent neighborhood and to not have a paseo connecting this property through to State Street.

13. **Paseos.** Incorporate pedestrian-scale paseos in new development to facilitate interaction and transportation connections between the commercial corridor and surrounding residential areas.

18. **Pedestrian Buffers.** Buffer pedestrian facilities from automobiles, particularly in locations where parking lines commercial development and cars overhang the sidewalk.

19. **Paseo Connections.** Where there are opportunities, establish paseo connections between retail areas and residential neighborhoods; consider public safety and maintenance issues in determining locations and design.

Goal: Improve pedestrian and bicycle facilities within the corridor, and increase connectivity between parcels and between the commercial corridor and surrounding neighborhoods. Implement streetscape improvements and pedestrian and bicycle connections through private projects.

61. **Access Management.** Development projects should incorporate the following access management techniques:

a. Achieve uniform spacing of driveways along the street as much as possible.

b. Require complete on-site circulation including safe pedestrian paths.

c. Ensure design of adequate driveway throat length to avoid a conflict with the flow of off-site traffic and provide adequate corner clearance.

d. Orient lots, buildings, and access points to side streets when feasible.

62. **Pedestrian Connections.** Improve sidewalk connections along cross streets and establish more paseo connections through parcels to increase pedestrian connectivity throughout the corridor as parcels are redeveloped. (See Figure 8 for locations for cross-street sidewalk improvements, and blocks where new mid-block pedestrian paseos would improve connectivity.) Establish long-term operation and maintenance agreements to assure paseos' availability for public use.

Trash Dumpster Location. Guidelines 14 and 53 call for reducing incompatible structure adjacencies between commercial and residential uses and screening trash enclosures with landscaping. Demolition of approximately 25% of the floor area of buildings on this site and creation of 10 new parking spaces on the site would appear to present ample opportunity to relocate the trash dumpster away from the property line that is closest to the single-family residential area and closer to the commercial structure. Setting the trash enclosure further within the site could allow for greater landscape screening opportunities.

14. **Neighborhood Compatibility.** Development proposals should be compatible with their surrounding sub-area and sub-neighborhood. For commercial developments adjacent to residential uses, separation and buffering between residential and commercial development and landscaping are especially important.

53. Landscape design should identify entrances to buildings and parking lots, direct traffic and pedestrian flow, and screen objectionable views (i.e. trash enclosures, backflow preventers, etc.).

Front Façade. Given the demolition of 25% of the site's existing square footage, addition of ten parking spaces and other changes, attention to the front façade of the structure for guidelines consistency is appropriate. USSDG call for pedestrian friendly details such as street furniture, display windows and human scale elements. Given the current indented façade design, provision of street furniture such as quality news racks, planter or foundation landscaping, bike parking and display windows rather than recessed highly mullioned windows would be more consistent with these guidelines. A

true arcade style façade or an awning system overhanging the sidewalk would be an optimal pedestrian friendly solution for this site, consistent with Eastern Sub Area pedestrian-friendly façade patterns.

11. **Key Characteristics.** The Upper State Street corridor, sub-areas, and sub-neighborhoods have key characteristics that define their character and sense of place. Proposals should be within a range of architectural styles and materials appropriate within each sub-area. Inclusion of more contemporary styles and natural materials such as sandstone, stucco, and tile is encouraged in the Upper State Street corridor.

14. **Neighborhood Compatibility.** Development proposals should be compatible with their surrounding sub-area and sub-neighborhood. For commercial developments adjacent to residential uses, separation and buffering between residential and commercial development and landscaping are especially important.

17. **Landscaping.** Incorporate landscaping at building frontages to improve the pedestrian environment aesthetically, and in parking lots to screen automobiles and provide shade.

23. **Front Setback Use.** The use of land within the front yard along State Street should be carefully considered to promote a pedestrian friendly streetscape. Public amenities such as landscaping, patios, fountains, outdoor dining and gathering spaces where public vistas can be enjoyed and street furniture, including refuse receptacles, bicycle parking and news racks are encouraged.

Goal: Achieve high appropriate quality aesthetically pleasing architecture within the Upper State Street Area.

42. **Architectural Elements.** Architectural features which help to soften and humanize a building are recommended. These include arches, columns, trellises, deeply recessed windows and doors, moldings and built up planters.

46. **Exterior Finishes.** The use of plaster as an exterior material is encouraged. Additional quality materials such as wood, masonry or tile may also be used. An appropriate mix of materials may be employed to add variation and articulation to architectural forms and styles. Excessively reflective or mirrored exterior materials shall be avoided. Glazing and fenestration should be used in a manner which is consistent with the proposed building's architectural style. Larger glazing areas should be articulated to provide scale to openings. Glass which is excessively tinted or mirrored shall be avoided.

47. **Building Facades.** The facade of a building, particularly at street level has a direct effect on its relationship to the public realm. Its qualities of openness, detailing, setbacks and ornamentation contribute to how welcoming a presence it presents to the passerby.

48. **Street Facades.** To encourage a more pedestrian-friendly streetscape, street facades shall contain storefronts, windows, entries and other scalegiving architectural elements. Facades shall strive to create a visual and physical

connection between a building's interior activities and the pedestrian streetscape to create visual interest for pedestrians. Expanses of blank walls, excessive grade changes, large, raised planters and other physical and visual obstacles between the pedestrian and a building's contents isolate the pedestrian and therefore should be avoided.

57. Encourage foundation planting where planting does not obscure window displays.

Adjacent Bus Stop Opportunities. Also, a bus stop is located in front of the adjacent gas station. Pedestrian furniture to support the bus stop, such as a bench under the covered portion of the building, or provision of a bicycle post under the westernmost portion of the building would increase consistency with guidelines 15 and 34.

Goal: Improve the public streetscape and adjacent pedestrian connections. The landscaping between the parking lot and the sidewalk provides a visual buffer, enhancing the pedestrian experience.

15. **Development Design.** Incorporate elements within site layout and building design to facilitate pedestrian activity and create a lively, pedestrian-friendly environment along the street such as: building entrances and outdoor activity spaces, landscaping, plazas, paseos, fountains, furniture, lighting, trash receptacles, etc. to support pedestrian use and **facilitate use of mass transit.**

Goal: Improve transit facilities and service, and encourage increased ridership.

34. **Seating.** New public spaces should provide as many seating opportunities as possible. Wherever possible provide seating adjacent to bus stops.

Goal: Preserve and enhance the unique character of Upper State Street and its sub-areas and sub-neighborhoods.

Bicycle Parking. Racks should be located where there will be the least possible conflicts between bicyclists, cars, and pedestrians.

- Public racks placed closer to State Street and the alley would be more practical, although the adjoining neighborhood may prefer not to have racks adjacent to the alley. The Standards for Parking Design specify a back-out or maneuvering aisles of at least 5' between the bicycle parking area and the nearest structure or pedestrian or vehicle pathway.
- The location of the "covered" parking in a corner of the proposed warehouse far from the warehouse entrance is not practical, the racks should be adjacent to the warehouse entrance.
- If the bike racks are to remain in the existing proposed location, what is the pavement connection between the parking lot asphalt and the bike parking area?

63. **Bicycle Parking.** Provide quality bicycle parking for both the public and employees, consistent with the Bicycle Master Plan.

Bicycle Master Plan Guidelines:

3.2.3 Locate hitching posts so they are easily seen and accessed from the

bikeway.

3.2.4 Clearly identify alternative location of hitching posts when they can not be placed near the bikeway.

3.2.5 Provide curb cuts and stairwell grooves for access to elevated parking areas.

3.4.8 Consider providing bicycle parking and storage at all transit facilities, bus stops, park and ride lots, and passenger rail and airport terminals.

Landscaping – Views Preservation. Trees selected to preserve mountain views would be consistent with guidelines. Skyline trees are not recommended on the north side of State Street if they would impede views. Therefore, tree choices shorter than Queen Palms trees may be preferable for guideline consistency. Also, it appears the removal of the rear portion of the building may afford mountain views across the gas station and rear of this property to the mountains. As such, low hedges, rather than tall palm trees would be a better choice for view preservation in the northwest corner of the property.

Landscaping selected to be compatible with nearby properties would be consistent with USSG #59. Further information on how the tree selected to be adjacent to State Street is compatible with surrounding properties would be helpful.

20. **Street Trees.** Street tree choices shall be consistent with the Street Tree Master Plan and be appropriate with respect to pedestrian safety, sidewalk maintenance, shade and aesthetic considerations.

Goal: Maintain the backdrop of panoramic mountain views that contributes to the area's sense of place. Protect or establish intermittent and recurring mountain view corridors and viewing locations.

25. **View.** Protect and/or create mountain views when siting new buildings, parking, and streetscapes. See Guideline 17 regarding parking placement strategies to protect views.

Goal: Encourage the generous planting of landscaping as part of development proposals and encourage skyline trees where appropriate. Ensure landscaping is compatible with the natural environment.

28. **Intersection Views.** Protect views at corners that intersect with State Street.

29. **Landscaping and Trees.** Provide appropriate designs and plant species within landscape plans to frame views but not substantially block them.

51. Mature skyline and canopy trees bordering State Street should be preserved and protected. Removal of trees could be considered where views can be enhanced or created.

52. Where planting space permits and views would not be impeded, encourage the planting of large skyline trees such as *Platanus racemosa* (California Sycamore) and canopy trees bordering State Street. Select trees that are visually compatible with the existing street trees.

59. Use landscaping elements that complement the characteristics of nearby developments.

Sidewalk Tree Grates. If tree grates were proposed in the tree wells for the existing sidewalk palm trees, consistency with guideline #55 would be demonstrated.

55. Use flush tree grates around tree trunks and steel reinforced paving around planters in sidewalk areas. Root barriers should be installed where buttressing root species are planted

III. Additional Details Needed

Project consistency with USSDG for the following topics cannot be determined until additional project information is submitted.

Lighting. Guideline 61.b calls for lighting to ensure safe pedestrian pathways. A lighting plan for the parking lots, the pedestrian connection between State Street and the entrance, and the warehouse entrance should be detailed, including photometrics. The ABR may consider routing the plans to the Police Department to ensure lighting proposals meet their standards for safety at this site. Additionally, lighting needs to be directed and shielded to minimize impacts on the adjacent single family neighborhood.

Goal:

- Ease and safety of ingress and egress shall be given careful consideration.

9. **Parking lot lighting.** Parking lot lighting shall be integrated with trees. It is preferred that pole lighting be limited to twelve (12) to fourteen (14) feet in height. Trees should be in scale with pole-mounted light fixtures.

10. **Lighting adjacent to State Street.** Parking lots adjacent to portions of State Street that have street lighting should consider whether additional parking lot lighting is necessary.

56. Tree planting design should not be compromised by lighting requirements; however, adequate lighting for safety at night is to be provided.

Signage. Will there be a pedestrian scale sign hanging over the sidewalk consistent with signage on other Easter Upper State Street structures? Will there be a ground sign in the front pedestrian planter? Planning for sign infrastructure at the ABR stage of review may be desirable to ensure consistency with pedestrian friendly and signage USSDG.

49. **Ground-Lit Signage** is encouraged so as to integrate with the rest of the exterior lighting of the building.

Shopping Carts. Other BevMo! stores apparently provide shopping carts for customers. Are carts proposed to be stored for customer use outside the building? Where will carts collected from the parking lot area be placed?

53. Landscape design should identify entrances to buildings and parking lots, direct traffic and pedestrian flow, and **screen objectionable views** (i.e. trash enclosures, backflow preventers, etc.).

Warehouse Activities. BevMo! apparently has a large on-line shopping business component. Is this property proposed to be used to ship internet orders from the warehouse? If so, could the delivery truck pick up location affect the adjacent single family neighborhood and could there be a less impactful shipping location at this site?

2. Building Dimensions and Spacing. ...Buildings should not loom over smaller residential neighbors nor compromise the privacy of their exterior spaces.

IV. Design Review Compatibility Analysis.

1. Compatible with guidelines – “no” for USSDG, see above.
2. Architectural character of city and neighborhood. The existing front façade and trash enclosure are not compatible with neighboring Eastern Subarea pedestrian friendly street facades. Depending on their design, lighting and signage components could be inconsistent with city and neighborhood character.
3. Appropriate size, mass, bulk, height and scale. The building is not expanding, the reduction in size poses no issues here.
4. Adjacent Landmarks/Historic Resources. Not applicable.
5. Public views of the ocean and mountains. The project may slightly expand mountain views for those traveling eastward on State Street if trees are not planted to obscure the newly “opened up” area where the partial demolition of the existing structure is proposed.
6. Use of Open Space and Landscaping. See item 5 comments, above.

Guidelines:

40. **Compatibility Analysis.** Carefully consider the required Compatibility Analysis Criteria listed in Chapter 22.68 of the Santa Barbara Municipal Code to ensure that development is compatible within the context of the block, neighborhood, and sub-area.